



A CALL FOR AN OPEN, INFORMED STUDY OF ALL ASPECTS OF CONSCIOUSNESS

Etzel Cardena

Journal Name:	Frontiers in Human Neuroscience
ISSN:	1662-5161
Article type:	Opinion Article
Received on:	10 Dec 2013
Accepted on:	08 Jan 2014
Provisional PDF published on:	08 Jan 2014
Frontiers website link:	www.frontiersin.org
Citation:	Cardena E(2014) A CALL FOR AN OPEN, INFORMED STUDY OF ALL ASPECTS OF CONSCIOUSNESS. <i>Front. Hum. Neurosci.</i> 8:17. doi:10.3389/fnhum.2014.00017
Article URL:	http://www.frontiersin.org/Journal/FullText.aspx?s=537&name=human%20neuroscience&ART_DOI=10.3389/fnhum.2014.00017
Copyright statement:	(If clicking on the link doesn't work, try copying and pasting it into your browser.) © 2014 Cardena. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY) . The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) or licensor are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

This Provisional PDF corresponds to the article as it appeared upon acceptance, after rigorous peer-review. Fully formatted PDF and full text (HTML) versions will be made available soon.

A CALL FOR AN OPEN, INFORMED STUDY OF ALL ASPECTS OF CONSCIOUSNESS

Science thrives when there is an open, informed discussion of all evidence, and recognition that scientific knowledge is provisional and subject to revision. This attitude is in stark contrast with reaching conclusions based solely on a previous set of beliefs or on the assertions of authority figures. Indeed, the search for knowledge wherever it may lead inspired a group of notable scientists and philosophers to found in 1882 the Society for Psychical Research in London. Its purpose was “to investigate that large body of debatable phenomena... without prejudice or prepossession of any kind, and in the same spirit of exact and unimpassioned inquiry which has enabled Science to solve so many problems.” Some of the areas in consciousness they investigated such as psychological dissociation, hypnosis, and preconscious cognition are now well integrated into mainstream science. That has not been the case with research on phenomena such as purported telepathy or precognition, which some scientists (a clear minority according to the surveys conducted¹) dismiss *a priori* as pseudoscience or illegitimate. Contrary to the negative impression given by some critics, we would like to stress the following:

- 1) Research on parapsychological phenomena (psi) is being carried out in various accredited universities and research centers throughout the world by academics in different disciplines trained in the scientific method (e.g., circa 80 Ph.D.s have been awarded in psi-related topics in the UK in recent years). This research has continued for over a century despite the taboo against investigating the topic, almost complete lack of funding, and professional and personal attacks². The Parapsychological Association has been an affiliate of the AAAS since 1969, and more than 20 Nobel prizewinners and many other eminent scientists have supported the study of psi or even conducted research themselves³.
- 2) Despite a negative attitude by some editors and reviewers, results supporting the validity of psi phenomena continue to be published in peer-reviewed, academic journals in relevant fields, from psychology to neuroscience to physics e.g., 4-7.
- 3) Increased experimental controls have not eliminated or even decreased significant support for the existence of psi phenomena, as suggested by various recent meta-analyses 5, 8-16.
- 4) These meta-analyses and other studies¹⁷ suggest that data supportive of psi phenomena cannot reasonably be accounted for by chance or by a “file drawer” effect. Indeed, contrary to most disciplines, parapsychology journals have for decades encouraged publication of null results and of papers critical of a psi explanation¹⁸⁻¹⁹. A psi trial registry has been established to improve research practice²⁰.
- 5) The effect sizes reported in most meta-analyses are relatively small and the phenomena cannot be produced on demand, but this also characterizes various

phenomena found in other disciplines that focus on complex human behavior and performance such as psychology and medicine²¹⁻²².

- 6) Although more conclusive explanations for psi phenomena await further theoretical and research development, they do not *prima facie* violate known laws of nature given modern theories in physics that transcend classical restrictions of time and space, combined with growing evidence for quantum effects in biological systems²³⁻²⁴.

With respect to the proposal that “exceptional claims require exceptional evidence,” the original intention of the phrase is typically misunderstood²⁵. Even in its inaccurate interpretation what counts as an “exceptional claim” is far from clear. For instance, many phenomena now accepted in science such as the existence of meteorites, the germ theory of disease, or, more recently, adult neurogenesis, were originally considered so exceptional that evidence for their existence was ignored or dismissed by contemporaneous scientists. It is also far from clear what would count as “exceptional evidence” or who would set that threshold. Dismissing empirical observations *a priori*, based solely on biases or theoretical assumptions, underlies a distrust of the ability of the scientific process to discuss and evaluate evidence on its own merits. The undersigned differ in the extent to which we are convinced that the case for psi phenomena has already been made, but not in our view of science as a non-dogmatic, open, critical but respectful process that requires thorough consideration of all evidence as well as skepticism towards both the assumptions we already hold and those that challenge them.

Daryl Bem, Professor Emeritus of Psychology, Cornell University, USA

Etzel Cardeña, Thorsen Professor in Psychology, Lund University, Sweden

Bernard Carr, Professor in Mathematics and Astronomy, University of London, UK

C. Robert Cloninger, Renard Professor of Psychiatry, Genetics, & Psychology, Washington University in St. Louis, USA

Robert G. Jahn, Past Dean of Engineering, Princeton University, USA

Brian Josephson, Emeritus Professor of Physics, University of Cambridge, UK (Nobel prizewinner in physics, 1973)

Menas C. Kafatos, Fletcher Jones Endowed Professor of Computational Physics, Chapman University, USA

Irving Kirsch, Professor of Psychology, University of Plymouth, Lecturer in Medicine, Harvard Medical School, USA, UK

Mark Leary, Professor of Psychology and Neuroscience, Duke University, USA

Dean Radin, Chief Scientist, Institute of Noetic Sciences, Adjunct Faculty in Psychology, Sonoma State University, USA

Robert Rosenthal, Distinguished Professor, University of California, Riverside, Edgar Pierce Professor Emeritus, Harvard University, USA

Lothar Schäfer, Distinguished Professor Emeritus of Physical Chemistry, University of Arkansas, USA

Raymond Tallis, Emeritus Professor of Geriatric Medicine, University of Manchester, UK

Charles T. Tart, Professor in Psychology Emeritus, University of California, Davis, USA
Simon Thorpe, Director of Research CNRS (Brain and Cognition), University of Toulouse, France
Patrizio Tressoldi, Researcher in Psychology, Università degli Studi di Padova, Italy
Jessica Utts, Professor and Chair of Statistics, University of California, Irvine, USA
Max Velmans, Professor Emeritus in Psychology, Goldsmiths, University of London, UK
Caroline Watt, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, Edinburgh University, UK
Phil Zimbardo, Professor in Psychology Emeritus, Stanford University, USA
And...

P. Baseilhac, Researcher in Theoretical Physics, University of Tours, France
Eberhard Bauer, Dept. Head, Institute of Border Areas of Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany
Hans Bengtsson, Professor in Psychology, Lund University, Sweden
Michael Bloch, Associate Professor of Psychology, University of San Francisco, USA
Stephen Braude, Professor of Philosophy Emeritus, University of Maryland Baltimore County, USA
Richard Broughton, Senior Lecturer, School of Social Sciences, University of Northampton, UK
Antonio Capafons, Professor in Psychology, University of Valencia, Spain
Allan Leslie Combs, Doshi Professor of Consciousness Studies, California Institute of Integral Studies, USA
Deborah Delanoy, Emeritus Professor of Psychology, University of Northampton, UK
Arnaud Delorme, Professor of Neuroscience, Paul Sabatier University, France
Vilfredo De Pascalis, Professor of General Psychology, "La Sapienza" University of Rome, Italy
Kurt Dressler, Professor in Molecular Spectroscopy Emeritus, Eidg. Techn. Hochschule Zürich, Switzerland
Hoyt Edge, Hugh H. and Jeannette G. McKean Professor of Philosophy, Rollins College, USA
Franco Fabbro, Professor in Child Neuropsychiatry, University of Udine, Italy
Enrico Facco, Professor of Anesthesia and Intensive Care, University of Padua, Italy
Wolfgang Fach, Researcher, Institute of Border Areas of Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany
Harris L. Friedman, Former Research Professor of Psychology, University of Florida, USA
Alan Gauld, Former Reader in Psychology, University of Nottingham, UK
Antoon Geels, Professor in the Psychology of Religion Emeritus, Lund University, Sweden
Richard Conn Henry, Academy Professor (Physics and Astronomy), The Johns Hopkins University, USA
David J. Hufford, University Professor Emeritus, Penn State College of Medicine, USA
Oscar Iborra, Researcher, Department of Experimental Psychology, Granada University, Spain
Harvey Irwin, former Associate Professor, University of New England, Australia
Graham Jamieson, Lecturer in Human Neuropsychology, University of New England, Australia
Per Johnsson, Head, Department of Psychology, Lund University, Sweden
Hideyuki Kokubo, Researcher, Institute for Informatics of Consciousness, Meiji University, Japan
Jeffrey J. Kripal, J. Newton Rayzor Professor of Religious Studies, Rice University, USA
Stanley Krippner, Professor of Psychology and Integrated Inquiry, Saybrook University, USA
David Luke, Senior Lecturer, Department of Psychology and Counselling, University of Greenwich, UK

Fatima Regina Machado, Researcher, Universidade de São Paulo, Brasil

Markus Maier, Professor in Psychology, University of Munich, Germany

Gerhard Mayer, Researcher, Institute of Border Areas of Psychology and Mental Hygiene, Freiburg, Germany

Antonia Mills, Professor First Nations Studies, University of Northern British Columbia, Canada

Garret Moddel, Professor in Electrical, Computer, & Energy Engineering, University of Colorado, Boulder, USA

Alexander Moreira-Almeida, Professor in Psychiatry, Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Brasil

Andrew Moskowitz, Professor in Psychology and Behavioral Sciences, Aarhus University, Denmark

Julia Mossbridge, Fellow in Psychology, Northwestern University, USA

Judi Neal, Professor Emeritus of Management, University of New Haven, USA

Roger Nelson, Retired Research Staff, Princeton University, USA

Alejandro Parra, Researcher in Psychology, Universidad Abierta Interamericana, Argentina

José Miguel Pérez Navarro, Lecturer in Education, International University of La Rioja, Spain

Gerald H. Pollack, Professor in Bioengineering. University of Washington, Seattle, USA

John Poynton, Professor Emeritus in Biology, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa

David Presti, Senior Lecturer, Neurobiology and Cognitive Science, University of California, Berkeley, USA

Thomas Rabeyron, Lecturer in Clinical Psychology, Nantes University, France

Inmaculada Ramos Lerate, Researcher in Physics, Alba Synchrotron Light Source, Barcelona, Spain.

Chris Roe, Professor of Psychology, University of Northampton, UK

Stefan Schmidt, Professor, Europa Universität Viadrina, Germany

Gary E. Schwartz, Professor of Psychology, Medicine, Neurology, Psychiatry, and Surgery, University of Arizona, USA

Daniel P. Sheehan, Professor of Physics, University of San Diego, USA

Simon Sherwood, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, University of Greenwich, UK

Christine Simmonds-Moore, Assistant Professor of Psychology, University of West Georgia, USA

Mário Simões, Professor in Psychiatry. University of Lisbon, Portugal

Huston Smith, Prof. of Philosophy Emeritus, Syracuse University, USA

Jerry Solfin, Associate Professor in Indic Studies, University of Massachusetts, Dartmouth, USA

Lance Storm, Visiting Research Fellow, University of Adelaide, Australia

Jeffrey Allan Sugar, Assistant Professor of Clinical Psychiatry, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, USA

Neil Theise, Professor of Pathology and Medicine, The Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, USA

Jim Tucker, Bonner-Lowry Associate Professor of Psychiatry and Neurobehavioral Sciences, University of Virginia, USA

Yulia Ustinova, Associate Professor in History, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Israel

Walter von Lucadou, Senior Lecturer at the Furtwangen Technical University, Germany

Maurits van den Noort, Senior Researcher, Free University of Brussels, Belgium

David Vernon, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, Canterbury Christ Church University, UK

Harald Walach, Professor, Europa Universität Viadrina, Germany

Helmut Wautischer, Senior Lecturer in Philosophy, Sonoma State University, USA

N.C. Wickramasinghe, Professor in Astrobiology, Cardiff University, UK

Fred Alan Wolf, formerly Professor in physics at San Diego State University, the Universities of Paris, London, and the Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Robin Wooffitt, Professor of Sociology, University of York, UK

Wellington Zangari, Professor in Psychology, University of Sao Paulo, Brazil

Aldo Zucco, Professor, Dipartimento di Psicologia Generale, Università di Padova, Italy

References

1. http://en.wikademia.org/Surveys_of_academic_opinion_regarding_parapsychology
2. Cardeña, E. (2011). On wolverines and epistemological totalitarianism. (Guest editorial). *J Scientific Exploration*, 25, 539-551.
3. Cardeña, E. (2013). Eminent authors from other areas. *Mindfield*, 5, 83-90.
4. Bem, D. J. (2011). Feeling the future: Experimental evidence for anomalous retroactive influences on cognition and affect. *J Pers Soc Psychol*, 100, 407-425. doi: 10.1037/a0021524.
5. Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Di Risio, L. (2010). Meta-analyses of free-response studies 1992-2008, assessing the noise reduction model in parapsychology. *Psychol Bull*, 136, 491-494. doi: 10.1037/a0019840
6. Radin, D., Michel, L., Galdamez, K., Wendland, P., Rickenbach, R., and Delorme, A. (2012). Consciousness and the double-slit interference pattern: Six experiments. *Phys Essays*, 25(2), 157-171.
7. Hameroff, S. (2012). How quantum biology can rescue conscious free will. *Frontiers in Integrative Neuroscience*, 6(93), 1-17. doi: 10.3389/fnint.2012.00093
8. Bösch, H., Steinkamp, F., and Boller, E. (2006). Examining psychokinesis: The interaction of human intention with random number generators: A meta-analysis. *Psychol Bull*, 132, 497-523. doi: 10.1037/0033-2909.132.4.497
9. Mossbridge, J., Tressoldi, P.E., and Utts, J. (2012). Predictive physiological anticipation preceding seemingly unpredictable stimuli: A meta-analysis. *Frontiers in Psychology (Perception Science)*, 3:390. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2012.00390.
10. Radin, D., Nelson, R., Dobyns, Y., and Houtkooper, J. (2006). Reexamining psychokinesis: Comment on Bösch, Steinkamp, and Boller. *Psychol Bull*, 132, 529-532. doi: 10.1037/0033-2909.132.4.529
11. Sherwood S. J., and Roe C. A. (2003) Review of dream ESP studies conducted since the Maimonides Dream ESP Programme. *J Consciousness Stud*, 10, 85-109.
12. Schmidt, S. (2012). Can we help just by good intentions? A meta-analysis of experiments on distant intention effects. *J Altern Complem Med*, 18, 529-533. doi: 10.1089/acm.2011.0321
13. Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Utts, J. (2013). Testing the Storm et al. (2010) meta-analysis using Bayesian and frequentist approaches: Reply to Rouder et al. *Psychol Bull*, 1, 248-254. doi: 10.1037/a0029506.
14. Tressoldi PE (2011) Extraordinary claims require extraordinary evidence: The case of non-local perception, a classical and Bayesian review of evidences. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 2:117. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2011.00117
15. Storm, L., Tressoldi, P. E., and Di Risio, L. (2012). Meta-analysis of ESP studies, 1987-2010: Assessing the success of the forced-choice design in parapsychology. *Journal of Parapsychology*, 76, 243-274.
16. Schmidt S, Schneider R, Utts J, and Walach H. (2004). Distant intentionality and the feeling of being stared at: Two meta-analyses. *Brit J Psychol*, 95, 235-47.
17. Blackmore, S. (1980). The extent of selective reporting in ESP ganzfeld studies. *Eur J Parapsychology*, 3, 213-219.
18. Wiseman, R., Smith, M., & Kornbrot, D. (1996). Exploring possible sender-to-experimenter acoustic leakage in the PRL autoganzfeld experiments. *Journal of Parapsychology*, 60, 97-128.
19. Schönwetter, T., Ambach, W. & Vaitl, D. (2011). Does a modified guilty knowledge test reveal anomalous interactions within pairs of participants. *Journal of Parapsychology*, 75, 93-118.
20. <http://www.koestler-parapsychology.psy.ed.ac.uk/TrialRegistryDetails.html>.
21. Richard, F. D., and Bond, C. F., Jr. (2003). One hundred years of social psychology quantitatively described. *Rev Gen Psychol*, 7, 331-363. doi: 10.1037/1089-2680.7.4.331
22. Utts, J. (1991). Replication and meta-analysis in parapsychology. *Statistical Science*, 6, 363-378.

23. Sheehan D. (2011). Frontiers of time: Quantum retrocausation. Theory and Experiments. *AIP Conf Proc*, 1408, 255-278; doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.3663728>.
24. Lambert, N., Chen, Y-N., Cheng, Y-C., Li, C-M., Chen, G-Y., and Nori, F. (2013). Quantum biology. *Nat Phys*, 9, 10-18. doi: 10.1038/nphysS2474
25. Truzzi, M. (1978). On the extraordinary: An attempt at clarification. *Zetetic Scholar*, 1(1), 11-22.